

"
KP"VJG"EKTEWKV"EQWTV"QH"VJG"UGEQPF"LWFKEKCN"EKTEWKV"
KP"CPF"HQT"NGQP"EQWPV [."HNQTKFC"
"
"

" "

"

ZOELLER

okungf"d{"

qpn{"vq"ikxg"ghhgev"vq"vjcv"rwtrqug"d{"cnnqykpi"vjgo"vq"rtqeggf"ykvj"vjgkt"ecug"cpf."kh"vjg{"rtqyg"
vjg"cngicvkqpu"kp"vjgkt"eqo"rnckpv."gpuwtg"vjcv"vjg"Eqo"okuukqp"ku"qrgp"vq"vjg"rwdnke"cpf"vjg"
rwdnkeø"eqo"ogpvu"kp"hwvwtg"oggvkpiu0"Fqkpi"uq"ykm"rtqvgev"pqv"qpn{"Rnckpvkhuø"kpvgtguvu"dwv"cnuq"
vjqug"qh"cn"ogodgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke"kp"Hnqtkfc"yjq"ykuj"vq"rctvkekrcev"kp"vjgkt"iqxgtp"ogpvøu"
fgekukqp/ocmkpi0"

II. BACKGROUND

Chvgt"vjg"vtcike"gxgpvu"cv"Octlqt{"Uvqpg"ocp"Fqwincu"Jkij"Uejqqn"kp"423:."vjg"Hnqtkfc"
Ngikuncvwtg"etgcvgf"vjg"Octlqt{"Uvqpg"ocp"Fqwincu"Jkij"Uejqqn"Rwdnke"Uchgv{"Eqo"okuukqp"vq"
kpxgukicvg"vjg"ujqqvki"cpf"fgxgnqr"uejqqn"uchgv{"rqnkekgu"vq"rtgxgpv"kv"htqo"tgqewttkpi0"
C"ogpfgf"Eqo"rnckpv"*øEqo"rn0ö+Ê"530"Kp"423:."vjg"Eqo"okuukqp"jgnf"ugxgp"rwdnke"oggvkpiu"vq"
fgxgnqr"kvu"hktuv"ugv"qh"tgeqo"ogpfcvkqpu."ykej"kv"ocfg"kp"ctgrqtv"dghqtg"vjg"423:/3;"ngikuncvkg"
uguukqp0"Eqo"rn0Ê"620"Kp"423;."kv"jgnf"cpqvjgt"ukz"oggvkpiu"dghqtg"uwd"okvki"kvu"tgrqtv"hq"vjg"

t gp ko kqp"vq"

t kqp"vq"

t

cpf"&54"rgt"fc{"hqt"rctmkpi."qt"vq"rc{"c"eq o rctcdng"co qwpv."kh"pqv"o qtg."hqt"tkfgu"vq"cpf"htq o "
vjg"tguqtv0"Gki jvggp"fqmctu"ku"o qtg"vjcp"vy keg"Hnqtkfcøu"o kpk o w o " y c i g"qh"&:078"cp"jqwt"cpf"
&54"ku"pgctn{"hqt"vk o gu"vjcv"co qwpv0³"Vjwu."c"o g o dgt"qh"vjg"rwdnke"gctpkpi"o kpk o w o " y c i g"
eqwnf."cu"hct"cu"vjg{"mpg y."qpn{"cvvgpf"vjg"o ggvpki"d{"eq o o kvvki"6"vq": "jqwtu"qh"gctpkpi u"lwuv"
hqt"rctmkpi."kp"cf fkvkqp"vq"qv jgt"vtcpurqtvcvkqp"equvu"cpf"vjg"gzrgpug"qh"o kuukpi"v y q"hwmm"fc{u"qh"
y qtm0"Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"eqwnf"jcxg"jgnf"kvu"o ggvpki"cv"uk o knctn{/rtkegf"cpf"o qtg/ceeguukdng"
jqvgnu0"Eq o rn0"Ê"6:0"Cpf"kv"fkf"pqv"eqpukfgt"jqnfkpi"vjg"o ggvpki"cv"cp"ceeguukdng"rwdnke"hceknkv{"
uwej"cu"c"uejqqn."nkdttct{"."qt"wpkxgtukv{0"Eq o rn0"Ê"820"Vjg"qti cpk|cvkqpcn"rnckpvkhu"jcf"o g o dgtu"
y jq"ygtg"rtgxgpygf"htq o "cvvgpfkpi"vjg"o ggvpki."cpf"rtqxfkpi"eq o o gpv."d{"kvu"nqecvkqp0"Eq o rn0"
Ê"760"

Vjg"Qtncpfq"o ggvpki"y cu"hqt"vjg"rwrqug"qh"rtgrctkpi"vjg"Eq o o kuukqpøu"tgrqtv"o cmkpi"
ngi kuncvixg"tgeq o o gpfcvkqpu"hqt"vjg"4242"ngi kuncvixg"uguukqp"cpf"kv"y cu"vjg"rwdnkeøu"ncuv"
qrrqtvpkv{"vq"eq o o gpv"dghqtg"vjqug"tgeq o o gpfcvkqpu"ygtg"hkpcnk|gf0"Eq o rn0"Ê"64.";4/;60"Vjg"
cigpfc"hqt"vjg"o ggvpki"urgekhhgf"vjcv"rwdnke"eq o o gpvu"eqwnf"dg"o cfg"vq"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"qp"
Qevqdtg"38"cv"6<67"r0 o 0"Eq o rn0"Ê"990"Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp."jqy gxtg."cppqwpegf"cv"4<22"r0 o 0"vjcv"kv"
jcf"hkpkujgf"kvu"qv jgt"y qtm"cpf"y qwnf"vcmg"rwdnke"eq o o gpvu"ko o gfkcvgn{"kpuvgcf"qh"cv"vjg"
tgi wnctn{/uejgfwngf"vk o g0"Eq o rn0"Ê"9;0"Uq o g"qh"vjg"hg y"rgqrng"y jq"ygtg"vjgtg"cpf"tgcf{"vq"
eq o o gpv"cv"vjcv"vk o g"cumgf"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"vq"jqpqt"kvu"rquvgf"ci gpf"cpf"vcmg"eq o o gpvu"cv"
6<67"r0 o 0"Eq o rn0"Ê":30"Pqpgvjnguu."vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"kipqtgf"vjg o "cpf"gpfgf"kvu"rtqeggfkpi u"
y jkng"o quv"qh"vjg"rgqrng"y jq"rncppgf"vq"eq o o gpv"ygtg"uvknn"en route0"Eq o rn0"Ê":40"

Vjg"kpfxkfwcn"rnckpvkhu."Mkpug{"Cmgtu."Ejtkuvqrj u"\qgnngrEx qrj uu"cepeg,,b u pf! gy

y jkej"rtqxfgu<

*4+ Ogo dgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke"shall be given a reasonable opportunity to be heard"
qp"c"rtqrqukvkqp"dghqtg"cdqctf"qt"eq o o kuukqp0"Vjg"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"dg"jgctf"pggf"
pqv"qeewt"cv"vjg"uc o g" o ggvpki"cv" y jkej"vjg"dqctf"qt"eq o o kuukqp"vcmg"qhhkecn"
cevkqp"qp"vjg"rtqrqukvkqp"kh"vjg"qrrqtvwpkv{"qeewtu"cv"o ggvpki"vjcv"ku"fwtkpi"vjg"
fgekukqp o cmkpi"rtqeguu"cpf"ku" ykvjkp"tgcuppcdn"rtqzk o kv{"kp"vk o g" dghqtg"vjg"
o ggvpki"cv" y jkej"vjg"dqctf"qt"eq o o kuukqp"vcmg"vjg"qhhkecn"cevkqp0" í "Vjg"
qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"dg"jgctf"ku"uwdlgev"vq"twngu"qt"rqnkekgu"cfqrvgf"d{"vjg"dqctf"qt"
eq o o kuukqp."cu"rtqxfgf"kp"uwdugevkqp"*6+0"

*g o r j cuku"cf f g f +0"Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"fgpkgf"Rnckpvkhu"vjg"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"eq o o gpv"d{"cppqwpeki"
qpg"vk o g"ht"rwdnke"eq o o gpv"vjgp"vcmkpi"eq o o gpv"cv"cp"gctnktg."wpcppqwpegf"vk o g0"Vjg"rwdnke0"
pgzv"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"dg"jgctf" y cu"pqv"wpvka"after"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"hkpcnk | gf"cpf"xqvgf"qp"kvu"
rtqrqucnu"vq"vjg"Hnqtkfc"Ng i kuncvwtg"ht"vjg"423 ; /4242"ng i kuncvkg"uguukqp0"Eq o rn0"ÊÊ" ; 4 / ; 70"

III. ARGUMENT

Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp0u" o qvkqp"ujqwnf"dg"fgpkgf"dgecwug"Rnckpvkhu"jcxg"cnng i gf"hcevu" y jkej."
kh"vtwg."ujq y"vjcv"kv"xlqncvgf"Hnqtkfc0u"qrgp" o ggvpki"nc y u0"See Siegle v. Progressive Consumers
Ins. Co.": 3 ; "Uq0"4f"954."956657"*Hnc0"4224+*%Y jgp"rtgugpvgf" y kvj" c" o qvkqp"vq" fku o kuu."c"vtken"
eqwtv"ku"tgswtgfv"vq"-vtgcv"vjg"hcevwcn"cnng i cvkqpu"qh"vjg"eq o rnckpv"cu"vtwg"cpf"vq"eqpukfgt"vjqug"
cnng i cvkqpu"kp"vjg"nk i jv" o quv"hcxqctcdng"vq"vjg"rnckpvkhu000"*swqvpki"Hollywood Lakes Section Civic
Ass'n, Inc. v. City of Hollywood."898"Uq0"4f"722."723"*Hnc0"6vj" FEC"3 ; ; 8+++0"Rnckpvkhu"cnng i g"
hcevu"vjcv"fg o qpuvtcvg"vjcv"vjgkt"cdknkv{"vq"cvvgpf"cpf"eq o o gpv"cv"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp0u"Qevqdg"
o ggvpki" y cu"wptgcuqpcdn{"cpf"knng i cnn{"dwtfgpgf"d{"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp0u"cevkqpu0"Qp" c" O qvkqp"vq"
Fku o kuu."vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"ecppqv"rtgxckn" y kvj qwv"ujq y kpi"vjcv."kh"vjqug"hcevu"ctg"vtwg."kv"ku"akd# }

Ô c
figp base0h)taction0s

vjg"gzrtguu"vgt ou"cpf"vjg"tgcupcdng"cpf"qdxkqwu"ko rnkecvkqpu"qh"Ugevkqpu"4:80233"cpf"
4:8023360"Vjg"Eqwtv"ujqwnf"tglgev"vjku"ghhqtv"vq"okpkok|g"vjg"ueqrg"qh"vjg"ncyu"cpf"kpuvpcf"nqqm"
vq"vjg"rtkpekrngu"qh"dtqcf"eqpuvtwevkqp"qh"qrgp"oggvkpiu"ncyu"cppqwpegf"d{"vjg"Hnqtkfc"Uwrtgog"
Eqwtv"kp"Wood"cpf"Doran0"

B. Holding a Meeting Without Justification in a Location that Is Difficult and Expensive to Reach for Members of the Public, Particularly Low-Income Members of the Public, Violates Florida’s Sunshine Law

1. *Section 286.011 requires that public meetings be actually, not merely theoretically, open to the people who are affected by what transpires in them*

Vjg"Eqo okuukqp"cfqrvu"vjg"gzvtcqt fkpct{"rqukvkqp"vjcv"Hnqtkfcou"Uwpujkgp"Ncy."Ugevkqp"
4:80233."Hnc0"Uvcv0."cnnqyu"kv"vq"jqnf"kvu"oggvkpiu"cv"cp{"nqecvkqp"kp"vjg"uvcvg."jqy gxgt"
kpeqpxgpkgpv."kpceeguukdng."cpf"wpchhqt fcdng"ht"vjg"qxgt y jgn okpi"ocltkv{"qh"vjqug"yjq"okijv"
ykuj"vq"cvvgpf."uq"nqpi"cu"kv"ku"vjgqtvkccnn{"rquukdng"ht"vjg"rwdnke"vq"cvvgpf0"Dwv"c"eqpvtqnkpi"
Hnqtkfc"ecug"jcu"cntgcf{"tglgev"vjg"nqike"%

ed" # d % {"rqv g# qt# v t

Hk #

% q s Td % vw qe o " gpf0"0" s {vvgpf0"0"

:"

"

Dwv"Rhea"tglgevgf"vjku"etc o rgf"cpf"rgtxgtug"tgcfkpi"qh"vjg"uvcvwwg."tgeq i pk | kpi "vjcv"
ōjh_qt"o"ggvkpi"vq"dg"÷rdnke.øö"cpf"j gpeg"ucvkuh{"vjg"tgs wktg o gpvu"qh"Ugevkqp"4: 80233."ōkv"ku"
guugpvkc"vjcv"vjg"rdnke"dg"ikxgp" í "c"tgcucpcdng"qr rqtvwpkv{"vq"cvvgpf0ö"Id."cv"35: 6ó: 70"Vq"
fgvgt o kpg"kh"vjg"rdnke"jcu"dgpp"chhqtfgf"uwej"cp"qr rqtvwpkv{"vjg"eqwtv"jgnf."ō]v_jg"kpvgtguvu"qh"
vjg"rdnke"kp"jcxkpi"c"tgcucpcdng"qr rqtvwpkv{"vq"cvvgpf0ö"jcf"vq"dg"ōdcncpegf"ci ckpuv"vjg"Dqctf0u"
pggf"vq"eqpfwev"cy qtmujqr"cv"c"ukvg"dg{qpf"vjg"eqwpv{"dqwpfctkgu0ö"Id. cv"35: 70"Kv"vjgp"
uwi iguvgf"xctkquw"hcevqtu"vjcv"y qwnf"ko rcev"gej"ukfg"qh"vjku"dcncpekpi"rtqeguu."uwej"cu"y jgvjgt"
vtcpurqtvcvkqp"ycu"rtqxfgf"htq o "Cncejwc"eqwpv{"vq"vjg"o ggvkpi"nqecvkqp."cpf"y jgvjgt"vjgtg"ycu"
cp{"rctvkewnct"tgcucp"y j{"vjg"o ggvkpi"jcf"vq"dg"jgnf"kp"vjcv"nqecvkqp0"Id."cv"35: 7/: 80"Oquv"
ko rqtvcpv{"kv"tgeq i pk | gf"vjcv"vjg"ōg zr gpug"cpf"kp eqpxgpkppeg"qh"vjg"rdnkeö"ko rqugf"d{"vjg"
o ggvkpi"nqecvkqp"ycu"cp"ko rqtvcpv"eqpukfgtcvkqp"kp"fgvgt o kpkpi"y jgvjgt"vjg"rdnke"jcf"c"
tgcucpcdng"qr rqtvwpkv{"vq"cvvgpf0"

Tcvjgt"vjcp"gpici g"ykvj"vjku"dcncpekpi"rtqeguu."vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"uggmu"vq"nk o kv"Rhea vq"c"
uk o rng"twng<"o ggvkpi u"jgnf"ykvj"vjg"igqi tcr jkecn"dqwpfctkgu"qh"vjg"ctgc"o"rdnke"dqf{"ugtxgu"
ctg"cnyc{"u"kp"c"tgcucpcdn{"ceeguukdng"nqecvkqp"uq"nqpi"cu"vjg"rdnke"ku"pqv"rj{ukecnn{"dcttgf"htq o "
gpvgtkpi0"Rhea"kpfggf"fkf"pqv"fkuewu"y jgp"o"o ggvkpi"kpukfg"o"eqwpv{"o ki jv"wp tgcucpcdn{"fgp"
rgqrng"kp"vjcv"eqwpv{"cp"qr rqtvwpkv{"vq"cvvgpf0"Dwv"pqv j kpi"kp"kvu"cpn{uku"qh"Ugevkqp"4: 80233"ku"
nk o kvgf"vq"o ggvkpi u"qvwukfg"vjg"ctgc"o"dqf{"ugtxgu0"Kpfggf."kv"gzrnkekvn{"tglgevgf"vjg"ōdtki jv"nkpg"
twngö"vjg"rnckpvkhu"ycpvgf"*nk o kvkpi"o ggvkpi u"vq"ykvj"322"o kngu"qh"vjg"o ggvkpi"rnceg+"cpf"
kpuvgcf"jgnf"vjcv"vjg"rtqrgt"er rtqej"ycu"o"ecug/d{/ecug"dcncpekpi"vguv0"Id="see also Kennedy v.
Water."Pq0"422;/2663/EC."4232"YN": 649539*Hnc0"9vj"Ekt0"Ev0"Ugr0"49."4232+*"Rhea"ōuvcpfu"hq"
vjg"pqvkqp"vjcv"o ggvkpi"xgpwgu"ujqwnf"dg"fgvgt o kpgf"ecug/d{/ecug."dcugf"qp"o"y gki jkpi"qh"vjg"
rdnke0u"kpvgtguv"kp"jcxkpi"c"tgcucpcdng"qr rqtvwpkv{"vq"cvvgpf"vjg"o ggvkpi"cpf"vjg"eqmng i kcn"

;"

"

" Rnckpvkhu"fq"eqvpgpf."jqyngxgt."vjc"vjgtg"ujqwnf"dg"cevg"iqtkecn"twng"vjcv"kh"c"rwdnke"
o ggvpki "nqecvkqp"ecp"qpn{"dg"tgcejgf"d{"ect."htgg⁵"rctmki " o wuv"dg"qhhtgf"cpf"vjcv"hcev" o wuv"dg"
fkuenqug"vq"vjg"rwdnke"dghqtgjc"pf"kh"vjg"xgpwg"uwucm{"ejctigu"ht"rctmki0"Eq o o kuukqp"uvchh"
kpfggf"ugg o "vq"jcxg"wpfgtuvqqf"vjg"tgcupcdngpguu"qh"vjg"hktuv"rctv"qh"vjku"rqukvkqp."pgiqvckvki"
htgg"rctmki" y jgp"ugngevki"vjg"Q o pk"cu"vjg" o ggvpki "nqecvkqp0"Eq o rn0"Ê"730"Dwv"vjg{"vjgp"fkf"pqv"
fkuenqug"vjku"vq"vjg"rwdnke."fgvgttkpi" o g o dgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke"yjq"qvjgt ykug"yqwnf"jcxg"dggp"
kpvgtgugf"kp"cvvpgfki0"Eq o rn0"Ê"760"

Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"fqgu"pqv"cvvg o rv"vq"ctiwg"vjcv"htgg"rctmki."ykvjqwv"cp{"pqvkeg"vjgtgqh."
ku"cn"vjcv"vjg"Uwpujkg"Ncy"tgswktgu0"Pqt"eqwnf"kv ô vjg"rwdnke"ku"cu"fgvgttgf"htq o "cvvpgfki"c"
o ggvpki "kv"vjkpmu"ejctigu"&54"cu"qpg"vjcv"cevwcm{"fqgu0"Kpuvpcf."kv"encko u"vjcv"kv"ecp"jqnf"
o ggvpki u"kp"nqecvkqp"vjcv"ecp"qpn{"dg"ceeguugf"d{"rc{ki"ht"rctmki."ctiwki"vjcv"õugevkqp"

of the public to reach

kp"cf fkvkqp"vq"dgkpi"wpnc yhwn"wpfgt"Ugevkqp"4: 80233*3+." y jkej "Rhea"kpvgtrtgvvf."vjg"

Eq o o kuukqpøu"cevkqpu"cnuq"xlqncvg"Ugevkqp"4: 80233*8+." y jkej "urgekhecn {"hqtckfu"jqnfkpi"rwdnke"

o ggvpki u"kp"gzewukqpct {"nqecvkqpu<"

Cnn"rgtuqpu"uwdlgev"vq"uwdugevkqp"*3+"ctg"rtqj kdkvgf"htq o "jqnfkpi" o ggvpki u"cv"cp {"
hceknkv {"qt"nqecvkqp" y jkej "fkuek o kpcvgu"qp"vjg"dcuku"qh"ugz."ci g."tceg."etggf."eqnqt."
qtki kp."qt"geqpq o ke"uvcvwu"qt" y jkej "qrgtcvgu"kp"uwej "c" o cppgt"cu"vq"wptgcuqpcdn {"
tguvktev"rwdnke"ceegu"vq"uwej "c" hceknkv {"0"

È"4: 80233*8+."Hnc0"Uvcv0⁶"Dqv j"curgevu"qh"vjg" o ggvpki "nqecvkqp" y jkej "Rnckpvkhhu"ej cmmgpi g ô kvu"

nqecvkqp"cpf" rctmkpi "hggu ô k o rqugf"cp"wptgcuqpcdn" dcttkgt"qp"cvwgpfcpeg" y kvj "pq"

eqwpgtxcknkpi "lwvkhkecvkqp0"Vq"cvwgp f." o quv"Rnckpvkhhu."cpf" o quv" o g o dgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke"kp"vjg"

tgikqp." y qwnf"jcxg"jcf"vq"ftkxg"vjgtg"kp"vjgkt" xgj kengu."rc {kpi "hqt"i cu"cpf."nkmgn {"vqnnu"cpf"vjgp"

*cu"hct"cu"vjg {"mpgy+"rc {"&3: /54"hqt"rctmkpi0"Qt."kh"vjg {"fkf"pqv"jcxg"cxgjkeng"qh"vjgkt"qyp."

o g o dgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke" y qwnf"jcxg"jcf"vq"rc {"c"eq o rctcdng"qt"i tgcvgt"co qwv" hqt"cvzk"qt"

tkfgujctkpi "ugtxkeg"vq"cvwgp f"vjg" o ggvpki 0"

C" o ggvpki "nqecvkqp"vjcv"ko rqugu"cu"ukipkhkecpv"equv"qp"rqvgpvkcn"cvwgp fggg ô vjg"mkpf"qh"

o qpg {"vc" hqt"cp"qt fkpct {"rgtuqp"eqwnf"dg"vjg"fkhhgtgpeg"dgvy ggp"dgkpi"cdng"vq"rc {"c"vkn " "c"O"vkk_g" evq

qt"vjcv"o ggkpi "kp"o

õkh"cdqctf"qt"eq o o kuukqp"cfqrvu"twngu"qt"rqnkekgu"kp"eq o rnkcepg" ykvj"vjku"ugevkqp"cpf"hqnnqyu"
uwej"twngu"qt"rqnkekgu"y jgp"rtqxfkpi"cp"qrrqtvwpkv{"hqt"ogodgtu"qh"vjg"rdnke"vq"dg"jgctf."vjg"
dqctf"qt"eq o o kuukqp"ku"fggogf"vq"dg"cevkpi"kp"eq o rnkcepg" ykvj"vjku"ugevkqp0ö"Id0"cv"È"
4:802336*7+0"

Jgtg."jqy gxtg."vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"xkqncvgf"vjg"rqnkekgu"kv"cfqrvgf0"Jgpeg."vjg"uvcvwyg"
k o rnkgu"vjcv"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"ku"out of"eq o rnkcepg" ykvj"vjg"uvcvwyg"kh"kvu"cevkqpu"fgpkf"Rnckpvkhu"c"
õtgcupcdng"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"dg"jgctf0ö"Vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"enckou"vjcv"Rnckpvkhuø"uvtcki jv/hqtyctf"
kpvgt rtgvcvkqp"qh"vjg"vgzv"yqwnf"õetgcvg"c"jgcx{/jcpfgf"ugv"qh"tgi wncvkqpu"qp"uvcvg"cpf"nqecn"
eqnngi_ h| hg"c" " "

tgswwtg"rwdnke"dqfkgu"vq"rtqxfkg"uqog"iwkfcpeg"vq"vjg"rwdnke"cdqww"vjg"uvtwevwtg"qh"uwej"nqpi"
oggvkpiu0"Qvjgtykug."ogodgtu"qh"vjg"rwdnke"ykvjqww"vjg"lqd."uejqqn."qt"ejknf/ectg"hngzkdknkv{"vq"
urgpf"vyq"hwmm"fc{"u"cyckvki"vjgkt"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"eqo"ogpv"ykm"dg"fgpkgf"cp{"qrrqtvwpkv{"vq"dg"
jgctf."ngv"cnqpg"ctgcuqpcdng"qpg0"Vjg"tkij"vq"rwdnke"ceeguu"vq"rwdnke"oggvkpiu"ujqwnf"pqv"dg"
nkokvgf"vq"vjg"ejknfnguu"cpf"ygcnvj{0"

Vjg"Eqo"okuukqp"ekvgu"ugxgtcn"ecugu"hqt"vjg"rtqrqukvkqp"vjcv"Ugevkqp"4:80233"fqgu"pqv"
tgswwtg"rwdnke"dqfkgu"vq"rquv"ciqpfcu."dwy"pqpg"qh"vjgug"ecugu."qt"cp{"qvjgtu"qh"ykej"Rnckpvkhhu"
ctg"cyctg."eqpegtp"owwvk/fc{"oggvkpiu"nkmg"uvwt_ kmg vt ̂ ccc ccc ccc ̂ u n† "/

uwrrqtvu"Rnckpvkhhuø"kpvgtrtgvcvkqp"qh"Ugevkqp"4:8023360"Vjg"hktuv"ecug"vq"eqpukfgt"y jgvjgt"rwdnke"
o ggvpkiu"o wuv"jcxg"cpf"cdkfg"d{"c"rtgkxkwun{/rquvgf"ci gpfc."qp"y jkej"uwdugswgpv" fgekukqpu"
kpenwfkpi"vjqug"ekvgf"d{"vjg"Eqo o kuukqp"tgn{."ycu"*Hough v. Stemberge*"kv"jgnf"vjcv"tgswktpi"
õkvgou"vq"cr rgct"qp"cp"ci gpfcdghqtg"vjg{"eqwnf"dg"jgctf"cv"o ggvpki"y qwnf"htqgenqug"gcu{"
ceeguu"vq"uwej"o ggvpki"vq"ogodgtu"qh"vjg"igpgtcn"rwdnke"y jq"y kuj"vq"dtkpi"urgekhhke"kuuwgu"dghqtg"
vjg"iqxgtpogpvcn"dqf{0ö"49:"Uq0"4f"4: :.4;3*Hnc0"5f"FEc"3;95+0"Wpfgt"Ugevkqp"4:802336."kp"
eqpvtcuv."vjg"*absence*"qh"pqvkeg"qh"curgekhhke"vk"og"htq"rwdnke"eqo o gpvu"ku"y jcv"õhtqgenqug]u_"gcu{"
ceeguu"vqö"c"o ggvpki0"Vjg"o qtg"vk"og"vjg"rwdnke"o wuv"fgxqvg"vq"cvvgpfpki"o ggvpki"kp"qtfgt"vq"
rtqxkfg"ceqo o gpv."gxgp"kh"vjg"eqo o gpv"ku"wptgncvvgf"vq"o quv"qh"vjg"o ggvpki."vjg"nguu"õgcu{"
ceeguuö"vjg"rwdnke"jcu"vq"rtqxkfkpi"eqo o gpv0"

Uwdugswgpv"ecugu"tglgvki"cp"ci gpfcdtgswkto gpv"nkmg"y kug"uwrrqtv"tgswktpi"rwdnke"
dqfkgu"vq"urgekhh{"c"rgtkqf"htq"rwdnke"eqo o gpv"cv"ngcuv"htq"o wnvkrng/fc{"o ggvpkiu0"*Yarbrough*"jgnf"
vjcv"õhtqteki"o rwdnke"dqf{"vq"rquvrqpg"fgnkdgctcvkqpu"qp"o ikxgp"vqrkeö"dgecwug"o rtguu"tgrqtv"
kpfkecvvgf"vjcv"vjg"vqrke"y qwnf"pqv"dg"fkuewuugf"cv"vjg"o ggvpki"ycu"wptgcuqpcdng0"684"Uq0"4f"cv"
7390"Dwv."jgtg."kh"vjg"Eqo o kuukqp"cdkfgf"d{"kvu"rquvgf"uejgfwng"htq"eqo o gpv."kv"y qwnf"pqv"jcxg"
jcf"vq"rquvrqpg"cp{vjkipi0"Eqo o kuukqpgtu"y qwnf"jcxg"dgpp"tgswkgtf"qpn{"vq"cdkfgf"d{"vjgkt"
qtkikpcn"uejgfwng0"Cu"pqvgf"cdqyg."vjg"Eqo o kuukqp"ekvgu"pq"ecugu"htq"vjg"rtqrqukvkqp"vjcv"ukorn{"
hqnnqykipi"cp"cppqwpegf"uejgfwng"dwtfgpu"o rwdnke"dqf{0"Kp"*Law and Info. Services*."vjg"eqwtv"
pqvgf"vjcv"kv"ycu"õeqpegtpgf"vjcv"o dqtcføu"hc knwtg"vq"rwdnkek|g"cp"ci gpfcdkvg"o o c{"o kungcf"
kpvgtguvvgf"ekvk|gpu"kpvg"cuuwokpi"vjcv"o cvvgt"y knm"pqv"dg"cf ftguugf"cv"o uejgfwngf"rwdnke"
o ggvpkiö"dwv"jgnf"vjcv"õy jgvjgt"vq"ko rqug"o tgswkto gpv"vjcv"tguvtkevu"gxgt{"tngxcpv"eqo o kuukqp"
qt"dqctf"htq"o eqpukfgtkpi"o cvvgtu"pqv"qp"cp"ci gpfcdku"o rqnke{"fgekukqp"vq"dg"o c f g"d{"vjg"
ngikuncvwtg0ö"892"Uq0"4f"cv"32380" Jgtg."cickp."Rnckpvkhhu"uggm"pqv"vq"rtqjkdkv"eqpukfgtvcvkqp"qh"cp"

wppqvkegf"ci gpfckvg o "dvw"vq"gzgtekug"vjg"tki jv"vq"eq o o gpv"qp" o cvvgtu"vj cv"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"
rtq o kugf"vjg o ."c"tki jv"vjg"ngi kuncvwtg"jcu"cntgcf{ "fgekfgf"vq"i tcpv"vjg"rwdnke0"Hkpcnn{."Grapski"
uk o rn{ "tgnkgf"qp"vjg"rtkqt"ecugu"ykvjqwv"hwtvjgt"cpcn{uku0"53"Uq0"5f"cv"4220"

IV. CONCLUSION

Y jcv"Rnckpvkhhu"cum"qh"vjg"Eq o o kuukqp"ku"uk o rng<" o cmg"c"tgcupcdng"ghhqtv"vq"j qnf"hwvwtg"
o ggvpkiu"cv"nqecvkqpu"Rnckpvkhhu"cpf"qvjgtu"nkmg"vjg o "ecp"tgcej"cpf"vq"chhqtv"vjg o "vjg"qrrqtvwpkv{ "
vq"cr rgct"cpf"rtgugpv"vjgkt"xkgyu"cv"vjqug" o ggvpkiu0"Vjcv"qrrqtvwpkv{ "vq"rctvkekrcvg"kp"
iqxgtp o gpv"fgekukqp/ o cmkpi "ku"vjg"eqtg"kpvgtguv"y jkej "Hnqtkfc0u"qrgp" o ggvpki "ncyu"ygtg"etgcvgf"
vq"rtqygev0"Hqt"vjku"tgcupq."cpf"cn"vjqug"cdqyg."vjg"Eq o o kuukqp0u" o qvkqp"uj qwnf"dg"fgpkgf0"

"

Tgurgevhwnn{ "uwd o kvvgf."

/s/ Samuel Boyd

DCECTFK"N0"LCEMUQP"
Hnqtkfc"Dct0" Pq0"6994: "
dcectfk0lcemuqp B urnegpvgt0qti "
UCOWGN"V0"DQ [F"
Hnqtkfc"Dct0" Pq0"3234363"
uc o0dq{ f B urnegpvgt0qti "
Uqwjgtp"Rqxgtv{ "Ncy"Egpgt"
RQ"Dqz"34685"
Okc ok."HN""55323"
9:8/569/4278"

"

Counsel for Plaintiffs

"

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

K" JGTGD ["EGTVKH ["vjcv"K"gngevtqpkccm{"hknf"vjg"htgiqkpi"qp"Oc{"43."4242."ykvj"
vjg"Engtm"qh"vjg"Eqwv"wukpi"vjg"EOlGEH"u{uvgo."y jke j"ykn"ugpf"pqvkhkecvkqp"qh"uwej"hnkpi"vq"
cnn"rgtuqpu"tgi kuvgtgf"vq"tgegkxg"gngevtqpkc"pqvkhkecvkqpu"ht"vjku"ecug"kpenwfkpi"vjg"hnqnykpi<

Mctgp"C0"Dtqfggp"
Ugpkqt"Cuukvcpv"Cwqtpg{"I gpgtcn"
Qhhkeg"qh"vjg"Cwqtpg{"I gpgtcn"
Vjg"Ecrkvn."RN/23"
Vcncjcuugg."Hnqtkfc"545 ; ;/3272"
Vngrjqpg<*:72+"636/5887"
Hceukong<*:72+"635/9777"
Mctgp0DtqfggpB o {hnqtkfcngicn0eqo"
"

/s/ Samuel Boyd

UCOWGN"V0"DQ [F"
uc o0dq{ f Burnegpvgtoqi ""
Uqwvjgtp"Rqxtv{"Ncy"Egpgt"
RQ"Dqz"34685"
Okcok."HN""55323"
9:8/569/4278"